

ETHICAL AND MORAL EDUCATION FOR GLOBAL CITIZENSHIP

by Petcharat Lovichakorntikul*

ABSTRACT

In every country, the government has provided the mandatory education to its people in order to have good knowledge and better life. Since the globalization and powerful technology have removed the boundary of each nation, then people can connect to each other within a second. The research study had found out that an individual could reach another person who he or she has not known before across the globe by contacting only 6 people. Surprisingly, but it is true! Consequently, knowledge, skill, and ability that indicate people's competency can be transferred or even copied to another corner of the world easily and rapidly. As a citizen of one country, how can we fathom thoroughly on other nations' culture and etiquette as well as how can we have a good manner? In this situation, it is not only competency but also the courtesy which derives from cultivating ethical and moral education by their parents, school, community, and society at large. In this study, the researcher has examined and shared how to implant the basic habits that called "Universal Goodness" which will be beneficial for children as the global citizens. The qualitative approach was conducted for this study. The key informants were school directors, teachers, parents, and students who attended the World Peace Ethics Contest (World-PEC) program in the year of 2018 from Thailand, Mayanmar, Bangladesh,

*. Dr., Lecturer at Stamford International University, Bangkok, Thailand.

and Nepal. In-depth interview and focus group discussion were employed as means of acquiring data including documents and research papers related to this issue were analyzed and synthesized. Finally, this research will demonstrate how to cultivate ethical and moral education in practice to young children who are the global citizen in the future and subsequently they will bring the true peace to our world.

1. INTRODUCTION

According to the Levin Institute (2016), “Globalization brings the traditional concept of citizenship into question as it becomes easier to identify oneself with a set of common global interests shared by many,” since the digital networks move our world go forward and bring us come closer. Then we can contact to each other within a few seconds no matter how far we apart. To empower the learning knowledge in the 21st century becomes a piece of cake. Everyone can update his or her knowledge through the Internet. While there are plenty of researches on multicultural education trying to understand of cultural differences and sub-cultures and to recognize the existence of cultural pluralism that should be extended and preserved for the next generations.

In addition, James A. Banks (2003) emphasized that, “Citizens in this century need the knowledge, attitude, and skills required to function within and beyond cultural communities and borders.” In reality, our society needs to boost up the scale of global citizenship, it is no longer enough to simply categorize and even “care” about our global issues such as global warming, climate change, environment preservation, etc.; but individuals must develop their “Within Empathy” which means that our society needs to concern about “Ethics and Morality” to protect our chaos world. Once everyone understands and practices “Empathy” from his or her within, which originally starting from himself or herself, later on he or she will thoroughly understand others as well. Furthermore, Banks (2003) noticeably explicated that, “students need to understand how life in their cultural communities and nations influences other nations and the cogent that international events have on their daily lives.”

Besides, in the essay on Gender Perspectives on Educating for Global Citizenship by Dr. Peggy McIntosh; she has demonstrated

that, “the idea of a global citizen with habits of the mind, heart, body, and soul that have to do with work for and preserving a network of relationship and connection across lines of difference and distinction, while keeping and deepening a sense of one’s own identity and integrity.” Therefore, schools K-12 and institutions of higher education work to provide students with increasingly multicultural and cosmopolitan perspectives while teaching those highly coveted 21st century skills (The Levin Institute, 2016).

On the other hand, we had better utilize the benefits of advanced technology to implant ethics and morality to our new generations in order to prepare themselves to be better persons who are talented and virtuous human capital for our peaceful world. Hence, a good manner should be cultivated into them. In this study, the researcher has focused on the World Peace Ethics Contest (World-PEC) program which was organized by the World-PEC club in the year of 2018 in Thailand, Myanmar, Bangladesh, and Nepal. This project has highlighted on ethical and moral conducts in terms of learning the core values and principals and practicing in their everyday life.

2. THE WORLD-PEC PROGRAM

“Peace” is wanted by all mankind, but we have not discovered yet how to create and maintain the true peace in this world. Recently, there was one Thai Buddhist monk who definitely desired to bring the true happiness and real peace to our world by spreading out the Lord Buddha’s teaching and universal goodness throughout the globe. He was aware that the true peace starting from individuals’ mind. Since our mind was absorbed by defilements or immoral, therefore our world is still confronting with conflicts and war. As a result, Venerable Dhammadayo has been teaching Dhamma and meditation as well as cultivating ethics and morality to laypeople at all beliefs, faiths, cultures, languages, nationalities, genders, ages, education levels, and all walks of life. When one has the refugee for one’s mind, all suffering will be decreasing.

And this is why Ven. Dhammadayo has been promoting Dhamma teaching and learning with all means in order to everyone can apply to their everyday life. Nevertheless, the “Path of progress,” the Dhamma Contest for students starting from kindergarten to

university level, was first established in 1982 with 382 students to over one million students attended in 2018. In September, 2000, UNESCO had proposed and acknowledged the “Path of progress” program at the international conference on the theme, “Future of Our Children” at Geneva University, Switzerland. Afterwards, the World-PEC program was first recognized in February 2007 which aims to promote the inner peace and true happiness to all humanity. Henceforward, the good ethical education will be instilling to all participants like a basic foundation of their mind. Also, the book was translated from Thai language into other 4 languages, namely English, Chinese, Japanese, and Laotian. Later on it was translated into 5 more languages such as Indonesian, Malays, Spanish, Portuguese, and Arabic. In this case, there were participants from different nationalities and religions to take part in this program as well as to learn about the virtues, true inner peace, and meditation (World-PEC, 2019).

The World-PEC contest has two parts for students to complete. The first one is the written examination to measure on their ethical and moral knowledge and principles based on the book, *Values Education for Peace: Peace Ethics for Young People*. The second part is how to apply their knowledge into practice, so it will be a moral practice based on the Universal Goodness 5 (UG 5) which are composed of cleanliness, orderliness, politeness, timeliness, and mediation. This program encourage all participants to experience values education, ethics, morality, mindfulness, concentration, and peaceful mind in the real exercise as well as they all take note on their “Diary of Inner Peace” on daily basis. In addition, all of participants will have more awareness and understanding on universal goodness, morality, ethics, and good action. Finally, they would like to be a good people and try to preserve all good deeds then they will deliver it to the next generations. Ethical and moral knowledge is like the inner wisdom to brighten individual’s insight. As a result, everyone will be nice to others and be happy with oneself. Eventually, the whole world will be peaceful.

3. THE OBJECTIVES OF WORLD-PEC PROGRAM

To raise a child, we need to begin teaching him or her on how to differentiate the right things from the wrong ones and what is

merit and sin as well as the polite manner and etiquette that are very necessary to live in this world. The old sayings accepted that ethics, morality, mindset, and attitude are the basic principles which we need to instill to our children at an early age. Accordingly, we will ensure that these young generations will grow up to be good children for their own families, good students for their schools, and good citizens for their society and country. Ultimately, they will be the global citizens who will be the great human resources and bring prosperity, true happiness and peace for the whole world (Thanavuddho, 2013).

The World-PEC (or the World Peace Ethics Contest) program which was organized by the World Peace Ethics Club, has a good intention and core objectives on cultivating ethics and morality to young people who will be the future of our world regardless of their nationalities, races, religions, beliefs, faiths, age, gender, and education. As a result, they can use these moral principles as guidelines in their daily life to continuously search for success and happiness. Since we view Buddhism as the way of life and a universal philosophy for living, hence it can be integrated into any cultures and religious practices (World Peace Ethics, 2016).

This program has main objectives as the following:

- i. To promote young people to learn basic moral principles that are universal and accessible to people of any race, religion and creed, so they have Right Livelihood.
- ii. To instill creative potential in young people by encouraging positive personal qualities in daily lives, leading to a happy environment in both family and society.
- iii. To teach young people to become well-rounded citizens in quality and morality, so they can build our society and nation to success, happiness and peace.

4. THE FINDINGS FROM DOCUMENT RESEARCH

According to the Lord Buddha's teaching which highlighted on the heart and essence of Buddhist practice for individuals was the "Ovadha Patimokkha" which was first delivered on Magha Puja Day, the day of the full moon of the third lunar month. These

principles are 1) To cease from all bad deeds; 2) To do all good deeds; and 3) To purify one's mind. Starting from the smallest unit of our society, family had better teach their children at the early ages to know what is right and what is wrong. And parents should support their children to do good acts and avoid the bad ones. In the book, *Values Education for Peace: Peace Ethics for Young People* emphasizes on moral principles which are the thirty-eight Blessings (*Mangala*) of life. It seems like we are climbing the 38 steps of stair to improve ourselves to be a better person and lastly to achieve the highest goal in our lives.

Everyone is looking for happiness, progress, and prosperity in life, therefore it is like we are searching for "Blessing of Life." In this book, the blessings are divided into 10 groups as the following (Thanavuddho, 2013):

4.1. Blessing Group One: Prerequisites for a Good Person

People have originally accumulate their habits from their family, school, and surroundings. It is very important to not associate with the fools and only select good people to be our friends. Good friends will encourage us to think, speak, and do good acts and discourage us from all bad deeds. As a result, we will be ready to have more virtues by paying respect to those worthy people and learn from them.

4.2. Blessing Group Two: Fundamental Preparation for a Good Person

This step is for everyone who wants to improve oneself, then to live in a good environment is the key factor to develop the spiritual growth and to succeed in life with a strong intention as well as a powerful mind.

4.3. Blessing Group Three: Practice for Success in One's Life

These blessings in group three will enhance individuals to be beneficial to oneself and their society at large. At this level, everyone should train oneself to be fully equipped with knowledge, skills, and abilities in a pragmatic approach of artfulness in knowledge, application, usage, and communication.

4.4. Blessing Group Four: Practice for Harmony in Family Life

The fourth step is supporting everyone to be able to have a

stable and happy family life by well cherishing their parents, raising their children, cherishing their spouse, and not leaving one's work undone.

4.5. Blessing Group Five: Practice for Becoming a Good Person in Society

For these blessings, apart from our family's happiness, we have a duty to contribute the benefits to our community, society, and nation at large. Therefore, we ought to do some charity and practice universal goodness in order to get rid of our greedy and to purify our mind.

4.6. Blessing Group Six: Preparation for a Good Mind

From this step, it will increase more ethics and morality as well as destroy defilements so it might be the "Spiritual Development" for everyone. All these blessings are including abstaining from unwholesomeness, restraint from drinking intoxicants, and non-recklessness in the Dhamma. All of these things will enhance us to have a good mind.

4.7. Blessing Group Seven: Instilling Oneself with Basic Virtues

After we have prepared our mind to be ready for the basic virtues, in the sixth group of blessings will connect to the "Soft Skill" of human beings such as respect, humility, contentment, gratitude, and listening to Dhamma teachings. Anyone who can practice these blessings will be loved by surrounded people. We might call these people as "Charming" persons.

4.8. Blessing Group Eight: Instilling Oneself with Higher Virtues

In the path of progress, after we train ourselves to have basic virtues, next we need to cultivate more on higher virtues with patience, openness to criticism, the sight of a true monk, and having regular Dhamma discussion. At this point, we can learn more on other Dhamma knowledge because we are open-minded people and acquisitive to learn new things.

4.9. Blessing Group Nine: Practice for the Eradication of Defilements

In the ninth group of Blessings, we will learn how to practice the Dhamma in order to get rid of our "Badness" within ourselves

by practicing austerities, practicing the Brahma-Faring, seeing the Four Noble Truths, and attaining the Nirvana.

4.10. Blessing Group Ten: The Benefits of Having Practices until Reaching an End of Defilements

The last group of Blessings will bring us to the positive outcome and the highest goal in our lives. Since we have been training our mind by purifying it properly, we will feel joyful. Similarly, our mind will be a mind invulnerable to worldly vicissitudes, the sorrowless mind, free from subtle defilements, and be the blissful mind finally.

Consequently, the thirty-eight steps of Blessing will free individuals from suffering and unhappy situation. They have learned to discipline themselves; pay respect to their parents, teachers, and elderly; be kind to others; behave well; and eager to do good deeds. Similarly, individuals should practice on the basic virtues in order to cleanse their minds, no matter what races, creeds, ages, gender, this basic goodness will enhance the peaceful world for everyone and create a good working environment for every organizations when they collaborate together. Nonetheless, it will impact on the world's atmosphere as a whole (Lovichakorntikul & Walsh, 2015). On the other hand, individuals ignore to the Dhamma, have no Dhamma knowledge, and do not practice the Dhamma, our world is in chaos and is getting more critical conflicts around the globe. It is the signal of danger of world peace (Dhattajeevo, 2018)

5. THE FINDINGS FROM IN-DEPTH INTERVIEWS

The researcher has gathered the data from the students' Diary of Inner Peace and also the in-depth interviews with students, parents, teachers, and the principals from various institutions from Thailand, Bangladesh, and Nepal who attended the World-PEC contest in the year of 2018 and the ones who had attended in the early year of this contest.

5.1. Students' Perspectives

From the researcher's interview and observation, most of participants who attended this program shared their perspectives and more understanding on practical Buddhism in their daily lives. They could focus on their study and had more concentration and

mindfulness in whatever they performed. Furthermore, they felt happy and obtained the benefits of practicing according to the values education for peace.

There are some of students' opinions and sharing to this program. The first one from Ratchanuanan Phainog (2012) from Ramkhamhaeng Advent International School (RAIS), Thailand:

"I think the Diary of Inner Peace help me to develop myself. I learn to respect others, care about them, and also to keep a peace of mind. I think it helps me develop my character, behavior, and attitude. I think I have creatively and morally develop myself and have a good manner in daily lives which binds my family relationship stronger. I have learned the basic moral principles which are the universal knowledge that people of any races, religions, and creeds apply to their daily lives. I have noticed that my environmental in my family, school, and others grew better. It's actually brought peace to my community".

This program opens to everyone who have in different beliefs can join as well, for example Hye Won Jung (2012) from Ramkhamhaeng Advent International School (RAIS), Thailand, has revealed as follows:

"As a child born in a Christian family, courtesy is a normal thing for me. But as one human being, Sometimes I behave negative like a naughty girl. Writing this Diary of Inner Peace helps me a lot. As I begin writing this diary, I begin to feel that I must become well. I respect my parents, teachers, and every single people I meet. Even though this diary has come to end, but I'll continue to be righteous and courteous to everyone as a good student. I will continue to respect and love one another. I will try my best to make every place I go become happy".

In addition, opinion from I-yada Leelamasavat (2012), Santa Cruz Convent School, Thailand, has demonstrated that:

"When I participated this contest, I did many good things. I helped many people and performed to be a good manner in daily lives. In my opinion, I think that 'World Peace Ethics Contest' is a good contest. It makes me learn morality. I can morally develop myself and can apply to my daily lives".

From Tanai Tanachotevorapong (2012), Saint Gabriel's College, Thailand, has explicated as below:

"For me, this diary is one of the longest projects I have ever put my effort into. Someday during this project I felt so tired. My sinew expanded like a rubber tire, my muscle melt like an unrefrigerated beef jerky, that day, I was completely worn out. I would not mind waking up even if there were a fire burning up my bed, but this diary is a thing that wakes me up from the sea of tiring. It was not too over acting to say that this project had raised my responsibility to the next level. Moreover, it gave me a lot of moral-awareness in my daily life. Now I could even turn off my automatic mosquito search-and-destroy ability. Thank you so much for this project. Thank you so much for the ideal that you have been pursuing. I will be looking forward to your organized progress, no matter how far it goes or what it has accomplished. For the Peace of the World".

5.2. Parents' Perspectives

In this program, most of parents could notice the change of their children's attitudes and behaviors. There are some of examples representing about their impression towards this program. Rupali Jain's mother from Thai Sikh International School, Thailand (2012) has explained:

"I think this is a very good opportunity for young minds to develop moral principles and follow peace in this modern world. My daughter has changed a lot and I am proud of her. I have seen her write the diary daily, it is a good habit to write diaries and I have encouraged her to write it. She once also said to me that this new year the daily resolution will be her new year resolution".

Sirirut Pruktanakul (2012), a mother of one students from Patumwan Demonstration School, Srinakarinwirot University, Thailand, has indicated:

"It is time to remind about fundamental life skills and maintain good manners. My daughter can improve her discipline, relation, expression gratitude and many more. I am so proud of her effort and hope she will continue practicing every day until she has good manners that is the best thing and valuable. Thank you everyone who creates this project and gives the great opportunity to the children".

One more opinion which has proven the good change from her daughter studying at Patumwan Demonstration School,

Srinakarinwirot University, Thailand is proposed by Wanvipa Tangpradubkiat (2012):

“Starting to record in this Diary of Inner Peace, my daughter realized that she had to do more than usual to have something to be recorded in the diary each day. She tried to help more household chores. She got up early and often made up her own bed. She started to do meditation, though only at the short period of time every night. Sometimes, she prayed before her bedtime. During the month of recording the diary, I observed the improvement to her behavior. These repeated actions were really admirable to us, as her parents”.

5.3. Teachers' Perspectives

In 2018, the Bhassara Secondary School has participated to the World-PEC program for the first time, Ms. Abha Awale (2019), the principal of this school has described that “This program is very great. It is not only good for students but also for teachers and our school. The students can change their behaviors very well and so do the teachers by practicing meditation.

They know what is good and what is bad, then they do not stealing and they are willing to clean up and protect the environment as well. This program is very practical one and we can apply to our daily lives. Moreover, meditation helps students in learning and staying clam as well as respecting to teachers. Meditation is very important and all students and teachers meditate together every week. They all are very organized. I am very proud to join into this program.

This program cannot run by the World-PEC Club only, but the most important partner is teachers in every school. Consequently, one of the lecturers of Agrashara Girls College, Chittagong, Bangladesh has dedicated her life and put an endless effort to establish this program in Bangladesh. Hence, the first contest was held in 2017 with only 375 students attended the program. After that, in 2018 there were 1,675 students from 165 schools participating. The number of interested students has been increasing significantly. This made Mithila Chowdhury (Chowdhury, 2019), Joint Secretary General of World Alliance of Buddhists (WAB) and Secretary General of Nirvana Peace Foundation, feel very proud and very happy with the great outputs. And in 2019, she has

planned to have the World-PEC program in India as well. Her aim is to preserve Buddhism and build up the morality especially to the young generations.

The World-PEC program has expanded to many places in the world. Also in the Solomon Islands, Cynthia Manepuria's teacher (2012), Mbokona School, has shared her point of view on this program.

“As a class teacher, I want to thank the organizer of this program to help our future leader of this nation Solomon Islands by giving them such an interesting activities which you have provided for them for the last few months. They can learn more from outside activities, rather than just learning in the classroom environment every day. It is a good idea to bring peace to all people everywhere on this busy world. Wish you a God’s blessing as you continue with your program”.

As this program has been carrying out over 10 years, Mr. Silvino A. Bonifacio, Jr. (2019), Filipino teacher at Pingkarattana School, Chiang Mai, Thailand, was the World-PEC coordinator and has participated in the World-PEC program since the first time until this present. He has illustrated as follows:

“World Peace Ethics for young people is truly a great path to pave the way of young generations to become more award about their moral principles. As a teacher and coordinator of World-PEC, I have helped and encouraged our young learners to creatively and morally develop themselves and have a good manner in their daily lives. At school, our students have learned and practiced the proper way of praying, chanting, and meditation every day before they start school classes. We saw and observed their good responsibility as a student and role model to others. They are very respectful to their parents, teachers, and their peers. We are proud to tell the community and to the whole world that our students are morally upright and could be one of the best citizens of the world”.

One of the teachers from Patumwan Demonstration School of Srinakarinwirot University, Thailand, she is Kritapas Punpermcharoenkit's teacher (2012) has depicted:

“I think that this Diary of Inner Peace is good for students because they have more intention of studying in class and become a good student

with politely, good manner and positive-thinking. Moreover, it can enhance good habits to be a good person in society”.

Another's comment from Wimala Karinritchip's teacher, Kwong Chow School, Thailand (Karinritchip, 2012) is showed below:

“This is a very good activity of letting the students write their diary. They will be able to appreciate the good things (big or small) that they do. And in turn, it will help the students to improve their character. Through this diary of Wimala, my student, will be able to learn what good deeds they can do for their friends, family, environment and country. I hope that this will continue for a long year”.

5.4. School Executive's Perspectives

Ms. Saipin Sukunta (2019), School Licensee, ChiangMai, Thailand, has established the Pingkarattana School more than 30 years. She has highlighted as below:

“As a school executive of private school which provide the Basic Education for young people, I am also in charge of building up the good manner and courtesy for my students especially the “Right Understanding” to differentiate what is good and bad and then follow the universal goodness and moral conducts. I would like to express my sincere thankfulness to the World-PEC Program for its support to students in order to learn and to a good family members as well as the society. For the sake of good outcomes, it is not only good for students, but also for our teachers and parents. The World-PEC activity will enrich a warmed-family for parents and children whereas it also enhance a good relationship between students and teachers. Subsequently, this program does not develop moral conduct for students but also for our teachers as well. This is a good way to generate happiness and bring peace to family, school, community, country, and the whole world”.

6. CONCLUSION

From all of perspectives and comments from students, parents, and teachers who have participates in this program, we can notice that most of them feel happy and would like to thank the World Peace Ethics Club for bringing happiness to their family. They could observe the drastic change in their children in a good way. These young generations have learned and practiced some of the

fundamental life skills, especially improving in their discipline, respect, good manners and try to continue to practice mediation and being virtuous people. Students have more “Empathy” to help their friends in school and hale their parents to do some household chores as well as have more responsibility.

The feedback from some parents said that, “I like this program and it helped my daughter became more responsible and kinder to other people. She learned the most important value of life. I strongly recommend this exercise to everyone.” Whereas another one stated that, “We are glad to see this program is making an effort to implant ethical and moral values into the minds of young kids. We understand that this will help in the overall development of the children’s personality. We, as parents, would like to extend our gratitude towards this effort to the organizer and all the management team, teachers as well as supporters.” They do want this program to continue to cultivate the universal goodness to new generations. All the worldly knowledge can be learned and transformed rapidly; but the ethical and moral education are the most important knowledge for young people who will be the global citizen. They should learn how to behave properly and nicely and to be loved by all humanity.

In summary, the researcher has intended that the benefits from this study will impose to the related organizations, foundations, or any public or private sectors that prefer to create the shared values by bringing true happiness and world peace to our world. We can stay alone and we all need partners who would like to build up our peaceful society.

References

- Awale, A., 2019. Ms. [Interview] (19 January 2019).
- Banks, J. A., 2003. *Diversity and Citizenship Education: Global Perspectives*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Bonifacio, S. A., 2019. Mr. [Interview] (19 February 2019).
- Chowdhury, M., 2019. Ms. [Interview] (19 January 2019).
- Dhattajeevo, 2018. *The Ultimate Dhamma Reached by Paying Respect*. First ed. Bangkok: Rungsilpa Printing (1977).
- Jain, R., 2012. Ms., Bangkok: World-PEC Program.
- Jung, H. W., 2012. Ms., Bangkok: World-PEC Program.
- Karintrithip, W., 2012. Ms., Bangkok: World-PEC Program.
- Leelamasavat, I., 2012. Ms., Bangkok: World-PEC Program.
- Lovichakorntikul, P. & Walsh, J., 2015. *The Comtemporary Basic Morals in Sharing and Working together for ASEAN Economic Community (AEC) in 2015*. Ayutthaya, Mahachulalongkornrajavidyalaya University.
- Manepuria, C., 2012. Ms., Bangkok: World-PEC Program.
- Phainog, R., 2012. Ms., Bangkok: World-PEC Program.
- Pruktanakul, S., 2012. Ms., Bangkok: World-PEC Program.
- Punpermcharoenkit, K., 2012. Mr., Bangkok: World-PEC Program.
- Sukunta, S., 2019. Ms. [Interview] (19 February 2019).
- Tanachotvorapong, T., 2012. Mr., Bangkok: World-PEC Program.
- Tangpradubkiat, W., 2012. Ms., Bangkok: World-PEC Program.
- Thanavuddho, V. S., 2013. *Values Education for Peace: Peace Ethics for Youn People*. Bangkok: O.S. Printing House Co., Ltd.
- The Levin Institute, T. S. U. o. N. Y., 2016. *Global Education and Global Citizenship*. [Online] Available at: <http://www.globalization101.org/global-education-and-global-citizenship/> [Accessed 18 February 2019].

World Peace Ethics, C., 2016. *The 9th World Peace Ethics Contest (World-PEC)*. [Online] Available at: <http://www.vir2kidz.com/eng/index.html>, [Accessed 15 January 2019].

World-PEC, 2019. *World Peace Ethics Contest (World-PEC)*. [Online]

<https://www.dhammakaaya.net/%E0%B8%81%E0%B8%B4%E0%B8%88%E0%B8%81%E0%B8%A3%E0%B8%A3%E0%B8%A1/world-peace-ethics-contest-world-pec> [Accessed 21 February 2019].